

Minutes of a meeting of the Regeneration and Environment Overview and Scrutiny Committee held on Wednesday, 24 July 2019 in Committee Room 1 - City Hall, Bradford

Commenced 5.30 pm
Concluded 9.30 pm

Present – Councillors

CONSERVATIVE	LABOUR	LIBERAL DEMOCRAT	GREEN
Heseltine Herd	Berry Dodds Kamran Hussain Jamil Mohammed	R Ahmed	Love

Observers: Portfolio Holders for Healthy People & Places and Regeneration, Planning & Transport, and Councillor Debbie Davies

Councillor Jamil in the Chair

13. DISCLOSURES OF INTEREST

In the interest of transparency the following disclosures of interest were received at the commencement of the meeting:

Interests disclosed relating to Food Safety in the Bradford District, item 7 (Minute 18), Councillor R Ahmed operated a food business in Bradford. Councillor Herd operated a food business in Keighley. Councillor Kamran Hussain's brother was an owner of a restaurant in Bradford.

The Chair and Councillors Kamran Hussain and Mohammed disclosed interests in the item relating to Libraries, Museums and Galleries Service, item 8 (Minute 19), as they were members of Unite.

ACTION: City Solicitor

14. INSPECTION OF REPORTS AND BACKGROUND PAPERS

There were no appeals submitted by the public to review decisions to restrict documents.

15. REFERRALS TO THE OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

There were no questions submitted by the public.

16. CLIMATE EMERGENCY

On 15 January 2019 there was a motion passed by Full Council declaring a climate emergency. This motion had identified a series of priorities for the Council that would coordinate our efforts with the wider aims of the West Yorkshire Combined Authority energy strategy and delivery plan with the aim of limiting the district's carbon emissions in line with what is needed to achieve Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change recommendations.

The report of the Strategic Director, Corporate Services (**Document "H"**) highlighted the current stage of development of each of the priorities and made recommendations about the next steps required.

At the request of the Chair, the Energy and Low Carbon Project Manager with the Strategic Director, Place introduced the report to the Committee.

Following introduction, a question and answer session ensued –

- How much carbon dioxide could be saved per year in the Bradford District?
 - 58,000 tonnes annually;
- What was the reason behind the lack of information contained in the report for not suggesting climate emergency as a crisis?
 - The importance of climate emergency had previously been acknowledged by Council, as a result, a motion passed to declare an emergency. In order to achieve the significant results that required the Council to fulfil its ambition, it was committed to delivering the priorities identified, as well as tackling climate change to create jobs and to help people reduce their fuel bills. At present, obstacles were in path of the Council to meet all priorities that required funding due to the lack of resources. However there were other ongoing replacement factors to assist in tackling climate change and an update progress could be reported back to this Committee at a later date;
- In terms of greater ambitions towards climate control, was the Council confident in generating its own heating?
 - Yes due to third parties providing substantial resources;
- In terms of embracing the opportunities provided by the H21: Hydrogen for the north project, what were the anticipated timescales?
 - Officers were engaging with different groups across the Council and the district to raise awareness of the H21 project and explore potential areas of opportunity. The Department of Corporate Resources and the office of the Chief Executive were leading on this current priority. As the scheme progressed towards delivery, internal preparation would need to be across a number of additional work areas and directorates however this was a long term project which required substantial population investment and the Council could inject up to 20% hydrogen into existing gas works however the

scheme would not be delivered until 2028; and,

- What were wider Council expectations for the future procurement of Council vehicles and for the installation of further electrical vehicle (EV) charging points across the district?
 - The Council was increasing the proportion of electric and hybrid vehicles in use for the Council fleet and supporting the roll out of EV charging points across the district to help promote uptake of EV use.

During the discussion, the Committee and officers covered the following points –

- This was not only about climate emergency but equally, connected services such as transport and due to the lack of studies undertaken on connected services, this was a vital opportunity missed;
- Bradford was one of the most deprived local authorities in the country and as many residents were facing financial hardship, it was doubtful whether Bradford residents could be influenced towards climate change;
- Due to current overcrowding on public transport, the whole connected transport infrastructure required new regulation but due to implications of less resources this would not be achievable in the short run;
- Bradford's lateness in tabling street lighting had environmentally benefited Bradford as new installed LED lights were more friendly climate reducing the Council's street lighting power consumption by a significant amount of carbon emissions per year; and,
- The key priorities would ultimately reduce the Council's carbon footprint.

Baildon Friends of the Earth (BFotE), a movement in campaigning for change in its community to make a difference to the environment locally, nationally, and globally was at the meeting and with the invitation of the Chair made the following representations to the Committee –

- **CAMPAIGNER 1** – BFotE was Bradford's only Friends of the Earth group. Several members had been involved with Clean Air Bradford to which governance support had been provided. Concerns had been expressed with writing to all Members of Council about the proposed expansion of Leeds Bradford Airport due to odds with climate emergency. A letter with similar wording was sent to all Councillors (WYCA and District), in West Yorkshire. He further explained his concerns of the lengthy time scales, as set out in this report and that immediate action was required as opposed to a few years later. It was paramount for the Council to identify a Climate Commission similar to one in Leeds as this would set an essential platform to engage with people in the district.
- **CAMPAIGNER 2** – BFotE had met with pupils of Titus Salts School who had spoken their fears about their future as they were mindful of being let down by elders especially politicians for not acting earlier on climate change. It was important for Bradford to grasp the opportunity by accepting responsibility to take lead on climate change as it was the youngest city in the country. Proof laid in the fact that each year the summers were becoming hotter and this was not normal usual weather conditions for the city. The report had explained measures but no clear targets had been set as opposed to Manchester had announced zero carbon by 2038.
- **CAMPAIGNER 3** – A climate campaigner of Bradford and a Extinction

Rebellion Bradford member laid out the following requests through the means of science so that the Council could better inform itself, (a) each year measurements on which predictions were made became more clearer and highlighted previous underestimated predictions of seriousness towards climate change; (b) this was a global impact. To think disruption of normal climate patterns, drought, floods, wholesale failure of crops, increased conflict and unprecedented migration; and, (c) imperative reasons for the Council to act now to decarbonise the local economy and ensure this was the basis of all Council decisions. A legitimate assembly comprising the district's residents should be appointed to protect its residents against the worst effects of climate breakdown.

- **CAMPAIGNER 4** – Baildon was a solar hotspot and not for reason of current weather temperatures. BFotE had enumerated solar panels on properties in Baildon and at last count, a total of 1215 panels. BFotE raised £16,250 to put 6kW peak solar panels and LED lighting in Glenaire Primary School, Bradford. Baildon Methodist Church had proclaimed 2019 as 'The Year of Green Bricks' and was constructing the first community building on Church premises in Britain, to a standard similar to that of a Passivhaus effect (*Passivhaus - building in which thermal comfort can be achieved solely by post-heating or post-cooling the fresh air flow required for a good indoor air quality, without the need for additional recirculation of air*). Therefore zero consumption of energy, zero production of carbon dioxide. A total of £800,000 had been raised out of a set target of £900,000. What the Council had achieved on its estate to tackle climate change should be praised but nothing had been actioned for the remaining of the district.

Resolved –

- (1) **That officers be thanked for Document “H” and that the Committee acknowledges that work on Climate Emergency is being undertaken beyond the five priorities adopted by Council in January 2019.**
- (2) **That the Executive, be requested to task officers to work with partners/providers to accelerate progress against the delivery of the five priorities.**
- (3) **That officers consider the comments made on Climate Emergency at this meeting of the Regeneration and Environment Overview and Scrutiny Committee.**

ACTION: Strategic Director, Corporate Services /Place

17. BRADFORD AIR QUALITY PLAN (BAQP) DEVELOPMENT

The Bradford Air Quality Plan (BAQP) was being developed in line with Ministerial Direction with the Outline Business Case (OBC), including the preferred option for achieving compliance with the EU Limit Value for nitrogen dioxide (NO₂) in the shortest possible timeframe, required for submission by 31st October 2019. The timescales for delivery were challenging due mainly to the readiness of the Bradford Transport Model in July 2019 which affected the timings of subsequent air quality and economic assessments. Following submission of the OBC to

Government, full public / Statutory consultation would be carried out which informed the preparation of the Final Business Case (FBC), due for submission in early 2020.

Government guidance on the development of the BAQP obliged the Council to assess all options for improving air quality against the effectiveness of a Clean Air Zone (CAZ) Class D, including buses, coaches, taxis, lorries, vans and cars.

Portfolio Holders and Strategic Directors of Health & Wellbeing and Place are delegated authority to submit to the Outline Business Case to Government and carry out consultation with all stakeholders.

The purpose of the report of the Strategic Director, Health & Wellbeing (**Document "I"**) was to provide an update on the development and potential delivery of the BAQP.

Following introduction of the report, a question and answer session ensued –

- Was Leeds City Council proposing finance packages for private hire drivers in order to meet the requirements of a cleaner air in the city?
 - In order to support the city's drivers, the authority had put together a planned package of grants and a loan scheme that it hoped would provide financial aid to drivers wishing to switch to compliant vehicles;
 - In response to answer, the Committee highlighted that maybe Bradford would need to move favourably towards assisting its city's drivers with finance in transferring from present petrol vehicles to a fully electric model vehicles.
- The grant, as highlighted in the report, did this also apply to Bradford's taxi drivers?
 - The Council had secured over £500,000 funding to enable local taxi drivers to convert to electric vehicles and local bus companies had also received over £2m in funding to improve emissions;
- Further clarity was sought on finance for taxis?
 - There were over 3,500 Private Hire Drivers (PHD) and 220 Hackney Carriage Drivers (HCD) in Bradford. The secured funding would be offered to PHD and HCD. The Council was intending to meet the expectations of national recognised government standards;
- If the Council was successful in rolling out funding for 3,700+ taxi drivers, then how would it intend in meeting the needs of providing charging points for these new vehicles?
 - The Council was developing a network of EV charging points, to encourage the use of EVs in the Bradford District such as new street lighting being installed which would include charging points. The network would enable all taxi vehicles to recharge;
- Due to taxis playing a pivotal role in the transport factor within the Bradford District, were drivers being update on all opportunities and incentives for schemes such as grants available?
 - The Council had engaged with drivers on aspects of vehicles, grants and other incentives;
- How was Council encouraging parents to stop using their vehicles school runs?
 - There was ongoing work with schools on this subject matter at this

- present time;
- What other scheme had been proposed to reduce emissions?
 - The Council had been considering a “park and ride scheme” (*to provide a parking facility with a regular public transport that allow commuters and other people heading to city centres to leave their vehicles and transfer to a public transport mode for the remainder of the journey*) and the most suitable site found to date was a Council owned site on Staithgate Lane; and,
 - Had any studies been focused on the use and routes of buses across the district?
 - As part of the Low Emission Strategy (LES), a Low Emission Zone (LEZ) Feasibility Study was carried out 2014 in partnership with Leeds City Council, Bradford NHS and Public Health England (PHE). The LEZ study was reported to Members in 2015. The study looked at the changes in emissions and concentrations of key pollutants in 2016 and 2021 based on local fleet data, obtained from Automatic Number Plate Registration (ANPR) cameras and projected forward. The study showed that 40% of the emissions of nitrogen oxides within the Inner Ring Road were due to buses. The study was innovative in that it looked at the impact of various LEZ scenarios on the health of the population of Bradford within the Outer Ring Road area and the resultant health cost savings. At now, Bradford Air Quality Plan (BAQP) planned to seek air quality improvements over a much wider area of the District than was considered in the LEZ Feasibility Study, with greater, aggregated health benefits for residents for the Bradford District. As a consequence the West Yorkshire Low Emission Strategy (WYLES) had informed the West Yorkshire Transport Strategy (WYTS) and provided a platform for inward investment to facilitate bus emission improvements, including school buses, and the ultra-low emission taxi scheme.

During the latter part of the discussion, it was mentioned that Inner city Bradford was heavily congested with areas consisting of number of schools close to one another. For this reason it was paramount for schools to challenge parents aggressively that lived at a close proximity to school to stop using their vehicles to school runs. In response, the Portfolio Holder for Healthy People and Places explained that there was ongoing engagement with parents and schools through a current programme “Living Well”, Bradford’s online resource which aimed to make it easier for people to be healthier and live a more active lifestyle. Living Well was about helping people to recognise how health and well-being could be and to find the right support to achieve a healthier lifestyle such as everyday activity.

Resolved –

That the progress made in developing the Bradford Air Quality Plan and the contents of Document “I” be welcomed.

ACTION: Strategic Director, Health & Wellbeing

18. FOOD SAFETY IN THE BRADFORD DISTRICT

The Council is required by the Food Standards Agency to have a documented and approved Food Safety Service Plan in place.

The report of the Strategic Director, Health & Wellbeing (**Document “J”**) was brought to Members to seek support for that plan.

The Environmental Health Manager was present and at the invitation of the Chair gave a synopsis of the report to the Committee. She explained that the Service Plan set out the measures the Council would implement to safeguard food and drink which was produced, prepared or sold within the district. The plan reflected the work required of food authorities by the Food Standards Agency (FSA) in its national Food Law Code of Practice and guidance documents.

A question and answer session ensued –

- Succeeding inspection of food, what inspection processes were put in place following packaging for the detection of contamination and cleanliness?
 - This part of the procedure was enforced through legislation by Trading Standards office;
- Was there any income generation for the Council’s Environmental Health Service?
 - Businesses were reluctant in paying for Council services however there was a fee of £200.00 per request to request a re-visit/re-inspection; and,
- Appendix 1 (Staff Allocations) sets out information on a lack of skills of officers. Why was a lack of skills of officers thought of following years of experience in this field and would extending the skills of existing officers to overstretch their efforts?
 - This was a national problem as a number of officers who were presently undertaking degrees and until successful completion of their studies were unable to progress into training for specialist areas. However current employees had degrees but still in need of specialist training in specific areas. However the Council was now able to recruit Environmental Health apprentices.

Resolved –

That the work of the Food Safety Team as documented in the Food Safety Service Plan 2019/20 be supported.

LEAD: Strategic Director, Health and Wellbeing

19. LIBRARIES, MUSEUMS & GALLERIES SERVICE

The report of the Strategic Director, Place (**Document “K”**) provided an update on progress made in the delivery of budget savings for 2019-20 for the libraries services since the last report to Members on 22 January 2019.

It also set out progress made in developing options for the delivery of savings of

£1.05m (Libraries) and £500k (Museums) in 2020-21.

The Assistant Director, Sport and Culture (ADSC) and other Council representatives were present and at the invitation of the Chair, gave a synopsis of the report.

Following introductions, the Committee acknowledged the delivery of the community needs assessment however expressed disappointment to the fact that the current process had not met with the resolutions of 22 January 2019. During previous discussion of this item, the Committee stressed the need of extending consultations to include the Manningham and Bingley Wards whilst covering other areas as this would then reflect the diversity of the district and, meet best practice standards of the Council. It was further resolved that all future options for both the libraries and museums service should be presented to this Committee in July 2019. An explanation was sought as to reasons for not meeting the agreed requests of the Committee.

The ADSC responded that, whilst analysing the missing gaps of the process, officers had been unsure of certain aspects such as the methodology of the delivery of consultations due to one area being different to another, hence the delay. However, having not met the previous resolution, the current community needs assessment was now significantly better shaped and officers would be knowledgeable to the extent of delivering all options for the Libraries and Museums Service to the Committee in September 2019.

The Chair then phased the discussion into a further question and answer session–

- What means had been utilised to undertake the current community needs assessment?
 - A third party had been brought in to undertake the consultations and means such as telephone surveys, focus groups and direct conversations with users would also be used;
- How can the Committee be assured that the Wards, including select areas within Wards that would be impacted and previously not consulted, would be consulted as opposed to previous consultations carried out?
 - The delivery method on this occasion was a prescribed, more focused, process concentrating on areas that would have a direct impact following a change in services;
- Was the current consultation process being undertaken having regard to the Equality Rights Act?
 - The process was being delivered according the law;
- Appreciate that it was not possible to consult every single person but the Committee, on the next occasion had to be satisfied that the consultation was delivered that in reflection of the geographical diversity of the district?
 - Officers will ensure that Ward Members would be kept updated on developments throughout the process in line with legislative requirements;
- What was the deadline for the final decision of the Libraries and Museums Service?
 - February 2020;
- Even if young people were not using libraries for books due to the ever-increasing use of technology, they were still accessing other services

provided by libraries therefore could assurances be given to the Committee whether young people were presently being consulted with?

- Yes they were an integral part of the consultation process; and,
- Further to 5.22 of the report, *“Investment in the service being a vital ingredient for future success of services however recent funding bids had not been successful as a result of strong competition from neighbouring authorities together with an inability to meet certain criteria”*, what was the basis of this Council’s failed funding bids for Bradford’s museums services?
 - Some Council’s museums services had restructured and Bradford had been slow in this process hence the failed bids. However following this process, Bradford’s museums services should still move towards the right direction through national standards.

At this stage, the Chair called upon attendees outside of Committee membership to make representations to the Committee.

- **Baildon Ward Councillor** - She stated that following her continuous engagement with residents, it had become apparent that many libraries in the district were not accessible. Many schools contained library sections but not accessible for Reception age pupils and that this resulted in serious detriment towards younger children. Libraries presently were more closed than open and therefore vital services were not being delivered to residents within communities. Parish Councils echo her sentiments.
- **Unite Union representative** – Explained that following Council’s proposed savings of £950k for 2019-20 and despite numerous meetings, nothing had come to fruition. The budget highlighted in the report was incorrect as previous reports / documents gave differing figures. Due to 65% of cuts to the Council, this was a significant threat to Council services and the Libraries and Museums Service played an important role within and for communities. Libraries was a statutory function of the government and it was an obligation of the Council to provide a suitable and reliable mandatory service to meet the aspirations of communities. Council officers had explained that due to the current community needs assessment, options could not be presented to the Committee until September however surely the service had officers of years of experience who should have undertaken the consultation weeks before meeting of this Committee today.
- **Learning Officer for Museums** – She stated that staff were concerned to be made aware of further reduction of resources and thus the possible closure of the Industrial Museum and Bolling Hall. She further mentioned that she recognised the fact of need for change due to insufficient funding but it was equally paramount for officers to consult with staff on proposed restructure as opposed to decisions being made by officers who had never worked in the Museums Service.

During the closure of discussion, the Strategic Director, Place touched on the sensitive nature of the process for everyone and that Council’s officers had worked tirelessly whilst under pressure. However all comments raised at this Committee had been noted and would be deliberated on before the finalising of proposal for restructure.

Resolved –

That officers meet with Members of the Regeneration and Environment Overview and Scrutiny Committee in early September 2019 to discuss the Libraries, Museums and Galleries Service Needs Assessment and proposals that come from that assessment.

ACTION: Strategic Director, Place

20. REGENERATION AND ENVIRONMENT OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY COMMITTEE WORK PROGRAMME 2019 - 20

No resolution was passed on this item.

Chair

Note: These minutes are subject to approval as a correct record at the next meeting of the Regeneration and Environment Overview and Scrutiny Committee.

THESE MINUTES HAVE BEEN PRODUCED, WHEREVER POSSIBLE, ON RECYCLED PAPER